

San Francisco Peaks Controversy

Overview:

The development of the Snow Bowl and the San Francisco Peaks was a contentious issue during the 1970's in Flagstaff. Students, by creating their own newspaper, will look at many different aspects of the issue, including environmental, religious, and economic concerns, by creating a newspaper. This may be done on the computer or on poster paper, depending on the resources available. Students will complete an article, including a journalistic "lead."

Objectives:

At the end of this lesson, students will be able to:

- Ø To understand the opposing sides of this controversy
- Ø To identify one key argument from each side
- Ø To compare points of view on development, environment and religious beliefs.
- Ø To write five to seven coherent paragraphs in newspaper column format.

Grade Level/Subject Area:

- Ø 11-12
- Ø Arizona/Hopi History
- Ø U.S. History
- Ø Social Studies

Materials:

Ø Primary source documents (listed below) from NAU Special Collections and Archives

§ Richard and Jean Wilson Collection

§ Walter Taylor Collection

§ John Duncklee Collection

Ø Sample newspapers – including the front page and editorials

Ø Poster butcher paper OR Computer program such as PageMaker

Time Frame:

Ø 4-5 days

Background (from NAU Special Collections and Archives Biography):

The "Save the Peaks" fight was a decade-long struggle, originally pitting local citizens against Summit Properties and its parent corporation, the Post Company. The object of the controversy was a 350-acre parcel of land in the Hart Prairie area of the San Francisco Peaks.

In the early 1970's, local Flagstaff citizens united to prevent the company's proposed development of the Hart Prairie acreage. Arguments for development included economic growth and jobs for Flagstaff, while opponents argued environmental concerns and religious beliefs of native peoples.

During the course of the controversy, the citizens of Flagstaff and Summit Properties became allies against the United States Forest Service (USFS).

Both groups felt the USFS, guardians of American public forest lands, extended the "Save the Peaks" controversy for many years by neither cooperating nor negotiating in good faith with either the citizens of Flagstaff or Summit Properties.

Instructional Strategies:

1. Opening:

- Ø Ask students their thoughts on the San Francisco Peaks or Nuva'tukau'obi.
- Ø How do they feel about the current issues regarding the Snowbowl and reclaimed water?
- Ø Reinforce the idea that learning from the past can help us in the future

2. Pre-activities:

- Ø Divide the class into cooperative groups
- Ø Instruct them to read the material, taking notes and highlighting pertinent information.
- Ø Create a chart:
 - For Peaks Development vs. Against Peaks Development

Ø Have student list main ideas for each side's point of view on their chart

3. Discussion:

Ø Review the students charts, writing answers from different groups on the board

Ø Ask students about each side:

- What does Summit Properties believe about the development
- What is the environmental stand?
- What are the religious beliefs of the Navajo?
- What are the religious beliefs of the Hopi?
- Did Summit Properties/Bruce Leadbetter understand Hopi beliefs?
- Did the Forest Service take religious beliefs into account? How?
- What led to the eventual success of this "Save the Peaks" controversy?

4. Student Instructions and Handout:

You are reporters and it is your job to report on the Save the Peaks controversy from the 1970's. Your editor has asked you to cover stories for the following headlines. Divide the topics among your group members. Use the information provided on the NAU Special Collections and Archives website and additional resources listed below:

1. Developers:

Article by M.K. Leadbetter 11/5/1970

Arnal Corporation

Summit Properties Point of View

2. "Save the Peaks" Organizations

Save the Peaks Position Statement

Jackson Browne to play in Flagstaff!

The Musical Message

University Students and their Response

3. Native Beliefs

Religious Beliefs - Navajo (pp. 7 – 22)

Religious Beliefs – Hopi (pp. 23 – 35)

- American Indian Religious Freedom Act

(Document pages 3-5/PDF pp. 11 – 12)

- The Hopi and their sacred mountain

(Document Pages 10-18, PDF pp. 17 -25)

- The Navajo and their sacred mountain

(Document pages 19-27, PDF pp. 26-34)

4. Environmental Impact Statements

Save the Peaks Environmental Impact

Forest Service Environmental Impact

- * Your article should be at least 5 paragraphs (including Introduction, Body and Conclusion)
- * Journalists include Who, What, When, Where and Why in the first paragraph (also called the 'lead').
- * Include a political cartoon about your article – an illustration with a caption
- * A class member will proofread your article before a final copy is completed.
- * You may also include "interviews" (Pretend or Real: Extra credit for a real interview with someone who participated in this issue during the 1970's – you must include a signature of your source)
- * Create your final newspaper either on your computer or on poster paper, combining all the work from your group. Your final project

should be the size of a regular newspaper.

- * Everyone in your group is required to complete each of the following:

One summary article _____

One interview (either real or pretend) _____

Political cartoon _____

Proofreading one group member article, interview, and cartoon _____

Completed Newspaper _____

Closing:

- Ø Students will present their newspapers to the class.
- Ø Review the discussion questions from your opening lesson.
 - What does each group think about the developer's point of view?
 - What could the Forest Service have done differently?

- How did Hopi beliefs play into the debate?
- What lessons can be learned from this controversy?
- How can these lessons be applied to current issues surrounding the San Francisco Peaks today?

Assessment:

At the end of this lesson, students will be able to:

- Ø Explain all sides of the “Save the Peaks” controversy during the 1970’s

- Ø Identify the points of view of the following: The Hopi, the Navajo, Summit Properties, environmentalists, National Forest Service.

- Ø Write 5 – 7 complete paragraphs, including an introduction, body and conclusion.

- Ø This checklist can also be used as an assessment tool, with assigned points.

One summary article _____

One interview (either real or pretend) _____

Political cartoon _____

Proofreading one group member article, interview, and cartoon _____

Completed Newspaper _____

Resources:

The Snowbowl Effect [video recording]: When recreation and culture collide, who pays the price. Indigenous action media (2005); directed and edited by Klee Benally

Final environmental impact statement for Arizona Snowbowl facilities improvements proposal, Coconino National Forest, Coconino County, Arizona / lead agency, USDA Forest Service; responsible official, Nora B. Rasure Albuquerque, N.M.: United States Dept. of Agriculture, Forest Service, Southwestern Region, 2005.

Respecting a mountain: proceedings of the Arizona Humanities Council, Northern Arizona University, Department of Geography, 1982 forum on the development of the Arizona Snow Bowl on the San Francisco Peaks, Arizona / edited by George A. Van Otten.

Loftin, John. Religion and Hopi Life in the Twentieth Century. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 1991.

Northern Arizona University Special Collections and Archives:

Richard and Jean Wilson Collection

Walter Taylor Collection

John Duncklee Collection

This lesson correlates with the following Arizona Social Studies Standards:

1SS-P1. Apply chronological and spatial thinking to understand the meaning, implications, and import of historical and current events.

(Note: Historical research skills and analytical skills. These skills are to be learned and applied to the content standards for grades 9-12.)

PO 1. Compare the present with the past, evaluating the consequences of past events and decisions and determining the lessons learned and analyze how change occurs

PO 2. Analyze how change occurs

PO 3. Use a variety of maps and documents to interpret human movement and the diffusion of ideas, technological innovations, and goods

1SS-P2. Demonstrate knowledge of research sources and apply appropriate research methods, including framing open-ended questions, gathering pertinent information, and evaluating the evidence and point of view contained within primary and secondary sources.

(Note: Historical research skills and analytical skills. These skills are to be learned and applied to the content standards for grades 9-12)

PO 1. Identify community resources that preserve historical information--such as libraries, museums, historical societies, a courthouse, the world wide web, family records, elders--and explain how to access this knowledge

PO 2. Identify an author's argument, viewpoint, or perspective in an historical account

PO 3. Distinguish "facts" from author's opinions, and evaluate an author's implicit and explicit philosophical assumptions, beliefs, or biases about a subject

PO 4. Compare and contrast different accounts of the same event, including hypothesizing reasons for differences and similarities, authors' use of evidence, and distinctions between sound generalizations and misleading oversimplifications

1SS-P3. Develop historical interpretations in terms of the complexity of cause and effect and in the context in which ideas and past events unfolded.

(Note: Historical research skills and analytical skills. These skills are to be learned and applied to the content standards for grades 9-12.)

PO 1. Show connections between particular events and larger social, economic, and political trends and developments

PO 2. Interpret past events and issues within the context in which an event unfolded rather than solely in terms of present day norms and values

PO 3. Hypothesize how events could have taken different directions